

Downtown Parking – Systemwide Modifications

Information Provided by Matt Smith of Nelson Nygaard

Compiled by Julie Mercier, Community Development Director

Date: 3/12/20

A) See Memo from Nelson Nygaard, dated 1/29/20 re: Parking Kiosk Recommendations, distributed to Select Board for 2/4/20 Meeting and again for 3/17/20 Meeting.

B) Follow up questions from 2/4/20, email exchange between Julie (black text) & Matt (red text):

1. Pay-By-Plate

a. Concerns were expressed about privacy and security

- i. What kind of data is collected / can be accessed through someone's license plate? **The plate number is used as an ID for enforcement purposes, but no other information is provided. For example, when the enforcement officer prints out the paid parking list (from the kiosk), all plate numbers of cars that have paid, are listed on a printout. The officer then compares the car plates with those on the list. If the plate number isn't listed on the printout, the car hasn't paid, and it's a violation. A ticket is then issued as any other ticket would be issued.**
- ii. Pay-By-Space wouldn't collect this type of data on users, but it could still track utilization patterns, etc., right? **Yes, it would collect utilization information, but what pay by space can't do, nor can pay and display, is track duration information. For example, if someone pays by plate for 2 hours, but then extends it another 2 hours, you now know a car parked for a total of 4-hours. Pay by space (or pay and display) would not provide this detail – it would look like 2 separate cars parked in the space. This is why pay by plate is more valuable – helps you to understand parking behaviors more effectively.**
- iii. What would we be giving up from a data/enforcement perspective if we used Pay-By-Space instead of Pay-By-Plate? **Enforcement is no different. With pay by plate and pay by space, enforcement officers receive a printout of paid parking – either the space number or the license plate number.**

b. Concerns were also expressed about the need to walk back and forth from car to kiosk

- i. Is it safe to say that with Pay-By-Plate (which I've never used), a user doesn't have to walk back to the car to put a sticker on the dash or am I misunderstanding how this would work? **The major advantage of pay by plate is there is no need to walk back to your car. You plug it in, pay and then go. Pay by space is problematic when people don't see the number, go to pay, and then have to walk back to get the number and then back to the kiosk. And pay and display is the worst, as it requires all parkers to pay then walk back to display the proof or payment. It's the major disadvantage – especially in lots where the distance to the kiosk is often greater. It's highly inconvenient for the parker.**

2. Free Period

- a. Select Board members feel that 15 minutes is too short of a free period, 2 hours was suggested **The purpose of paid parking is to better manage high demand parking areas**

where spaces are at a premium, typically because they are nearest amenities. Allowing 2-hours free wouldn't be effective in achieving turnover. If 2-hours are free, I think the cost of installing kiosks or meters isn't worthwhile either. Upping the free time to 30-minutes is perfectly acceptable. It still encourages turnover, but allows for unanticipated delays for convenience trips – e.g. long line at the pharmacy may go over 15 minutes free, but unlikely to go over 30-mins free.

- i. What is the maximum free period you think is advisable? 30-minutes (especially since on-street spaces will remain free)

3. Pricing

- a. Concern about up-front and ongoing costs of kiosks the upfront cost appears high, but they more or less pay for themselves, and then some. (e.g. 50 spaces at \$1/hr over 10 hours = \$50/hr revenue, or \$500/day). If only 50% utilized, the revenue is \$250/day. With approx. 300 revenue producing days a year (Sundays free, and holidays free), that is \$75,000 a year in revenue for the lot (at 50% utilization). Upfront cost is less than a third of the first year revenue. Ongoing costs include wireless connection (if want real time data, or want to include in parking app) – max \$1,200 a year, plus small maintenance budget (\$500). The Town continues to come way out on top.
 - i. In your experience, has paid parking resulted in more or less revenue than towns expect? Typically more, especially with kiosks. Meters (old coin ones and smart ones) display on the meter how much parking time remains. When someone leaves early, the next user sees there is time, and doesn't have to pay for that portion. When using kiosks – pay by plate especially, each person pays for their parking from the time they arrive, even if it overlaps with a previous paid session.
 - ii. What do we need to charge to recoup the costs of kiosks? I understand this can probably be answered in many ways. See the above. Based on that, even if you only charge \$.50/hr, and utilization remained at 50% on average, you would collect \$37,500 in the first year – approx. \$15K more than the kiosks. Even if utilization plummeted to 25%, and you charged \$.50/hr, you still collect \$18,750 a year, so it would take 2 years to recoup the cost of 2 kiosks.

If helpful, I could create a spreadsheet highlighting the kiosk costs (installation and maintenance), and the revenues (at different utilization and hourly cost levels), to estimate time to recoup costs.

C) Follow-up questions relayed from Julie to Matt:

1. LPR costs & timeframes for ordering/implementing – could the same company provide/service the LPR tech and the kiosks?
2. One thing I want to clarify: even though the kiosk just collects license plate info and nothing else, it would still be possible for the Police Department to take this license plate info and plug it into their other systems to get personal information, correct? But it sounds like this would not be automatic – it would be an extra step PD would have to take if they wanted to know more about a user/person.
3. I'll take you up on your last offer to create a spreadsheet on costs/revenues – I think this would be really informative. Can you show us the difference between 6 days of paid parking (including Saturdays) and 5 days (only Mon-Fri)? It's still an open question whether we would include Saturdays or not. I'll have to look at the utilization data. Do you have a recommendation on this? All of our other enforcement timeframes are just Mon-Fri. Perhaps having it broken down as

8:00-4:00 (8 hours of paid parking per day) and 8:00-6:00 (10 hours of paid parking per day) would be informative as well.

- D) See Memo from Nelson Nygaard, dated 3/11/20 re: LPR, Kiosk Data & Revenues, distributed to Select Board for 3/17/20 Meeting.
- E) See Parking Revenue Comparison prepared by Nelson Nygaard, dated 3/11/20, distributed to Select Board for 3/17/20 Meeting.
- F) Follow-up questions relayed from Julie (black text) with response from Matt (red text):
 1. It sounds like in the pay-by-plate scenario, license plate information would be collected and retained for purpose of analyzing parking patterns. Is there a way to anonymize it? A license plate number can still be traced back to the user (even if not by the vendor). Or is there a way to analyze the parking patterns lot without tying the patterns to the actual plate numbers?
 2. Under the proposed pay-by-plate system, as currently envisioned, who would "own" and have access to the data? The Town? The vendor? Both?

It's a little unclear about how the data is provided, but typically, the full plate is provided as part of the system. The key issue here is to ensure data use policies are clear and limit the ability of law enforcement to use the data. I think a good way to discuss is how the State uses license plate technology for all electronic tolling on the Pike and Tobin bridge. An LPR scanner snaps photos of every plate, processes through database, and then issues tickets to those vehicles who do not have an EZ pass. However, they have set strict data usage policies. For example, laws require subpoenas for authorities to access driver data, mirroring existing policies of EZ Pass system. So basically, anyone who has been using EZ Pass for years, or ever drives the Pike or Tobin, this is the same thing. It's enforcing something electronically.

Data retention policies – 30 days, 3 months, 1 year, etc. – should also be put in place to limit ability to track behavior.

Simply put, LPR is already a part of most people's daily lives. There are even parking garages that only use LPR for payment. Nearly every parking kiosk uses pay by plate – it's just manual. This is no different. And, most parking enforcement handhelds scan the barcode on people's inspection sticker, which links it to the registration, to provide tickets. It's all electronic. As long as policies are put in place to protect data, it should be good.